

# FTSE Russell Sustainable Investment Consultation

ftserussell.com May 2019



# FTSE Russell consultation on planned enhancements to sustainable investment products

# Introduction

FTSE Russell is committed to ensuring that our benchmarks and data solutions remain representative of the markets they are intended to track, and continue to address the needs of our users. As part of that, we would like to consult with market participants to understand how they use our sustainable investment products and how we can implement enhancements to further support clients.

The feedback received from this consultation will assist FTSE Russell in making decisions related to the topics considered. We value your input and participation.

# **Responding to the Consultation**

The proposals set out in this consultation document are included in order to gather feedback and may or may not result in changes to our indexes or data solutions.

Please submit your response to the questions included in this consultation online at <a href="https://www.surveymonkey.co.uk/r/7JWWRNZ">https://www.surveymonkey.co.uk/r/7JWWRNZ</a>

All responses will be treated as confidential. FTSE Russell may publish a summary of the consultation results, but no individual responses will be published and no respondents will be named.

If you have any questions about this survey, or if you encounter any technical issues, please contact rpawson@ftserusssell.com.

# **Background to the consultation**

Contextualising your feedback

In this first section we would like to know a bit more about your firm and the way in which you use sustainable investment data or indexes.

# FTSE Russell Sustainable Investment products can be used for a range of purposes. To help us understand how different clients interact with our products, it would be useful to understand the nature of your main role: Question 1: Business sector Academic, Asset manager, Asset manager (predominantly passive), Asset owner, Corporate Advisory/consultant, Investment consultant, Sell-side broker, Other Question 2: Business type Consulting role, Investment role, Lending role, Stewardship role, Other Question 3: Main working location Asia-Pacific, Europe, Middle-East and Africa, North America, South America Question 4: Sustainable investment integration The following questions seek to understand your firm's approach to sustainable investment as: Do you offer specific sustainable products or options? Do you integrate sustainability data into investment decisions within some asset classes? Do you integrate sustainability data into investment decisions across most asset classes, for example: equities, fixed income and alternatives?

# Question 5: Your source of sustainable investment (SI) data and indexes

Does your firm source sustainable investment data or indexes:	
	Mostly from FTSE Russell
	A combination of FTSE Russell and others
	My firm does not use FTSE Russell SI data or indexes, but does use SI data from other providers
	My firm uses SI data developed in-house
	My firm does not use sustainable investment data or indexes from any source

# FTSE Russell's capabilities

In this section of the consultation FTSE Russell is seeking the views of stakeholders as to the direction of its current and new capabilities.

FTSE Russell has developed a broad offering of products including sustainable investment indexes, ESG data, and green revenue data. Further information about these can be found here: <a href="https://www.ftserussell.com/financial-data/sustainability-and-esg-data">https://www.ftserussell.com/financial-data/sustainability-and-esg-data</a>

# Question 6: Sustainable investment data types

We wish to seek market feedback on the relative priorities that clients place on the following. We app	oreciate
that some of these categories could overlap. Please indicate the relative priority of these for your inst	titution,
using the ranking tool in the online answer form:	
Asset-level data (including from satellite or geo-spatial sources)	

		Broad/comprehensive ESG data (drawn from company disclosures)
		Carbon data and metrics
		Corporate controversies
		Ethical negative product screens
		Green revenues (revenue from products that provide environmental solutions)
		New, technology-led insights (AI, sentiment or other "Big Data")
		Social revenues (including towards the Sustainable Development Goals)
Qι		on 7. We would be grateful to receive further comments on the sustainable investment data
	-71	

# Question 8: Emerging sustainable investment topics We also wish to seek market feedback on other emerging themes within the sustainable investment

		ace that clients would like to see available in data or index solutions. Please indicate the relative prity of these for your institution:
		Animal welfare
		Civil liberties (e.g. comms & tech companies protecting freedom of expression and association)
		Social inequality
		Technology risks (incorporating cyber security, data privacy and the ethics of alternative intelligence)
		Use of plastics
		Other
		on 9: We would be grateful to receive further comments on your views on emerging tainable investment topics:
Qu	esti	on 10: Using sustainable investment data
		wish to seek market feedback on the ways in which clients use sustainable investment data. Please pose all that apply to your institution:
		Active investment decisions
		An input into investment research
		As a tool to assist engagement with portfolio holdings
		Exclusions in passive and/or active portfolios
		Portfolio monitoring and/or risk control
		Tilting security weights in passive investment
We	wo.	uld be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:

# Question 11: Quality and transparency of quantitative sustainability data

Given the large gaps in ESG information reported by corporates, some quantitative data such as carbon emissions need to be estimated for approximately 50% or more of listed large and mid cap companies. We wish to seek market feedback on this data, and hence whether FTSE Russell should help provide solutions.

	Please tick all with which you agree:
	Existing estimated quantitative data is of high quality
	☐ There is a high level of transparency of how estimation models work
	☐ I believe existing data estimation models are not transparent and/or of poor quality
	☐ I do not have a strong preference on this issue
We	would be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:
Que	estion 12: Using sustainable investment data
	We wish to seek market feedback on the asset classes we should prioritise for sustainable investment data collection. Please indicate the relative priority of these for your institution, where 1 is greatest:
	☐ Corporate fixed income
	☐ Equities
	☐ Real estate
	Sovereign, municipal, or supranational fixed income
We	
	would be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:
	would be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:
	would be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:
	would be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:
	would be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:
	would be grateful to receive further comments on this question or other requirements not set out above:

lf :	you have any other feedback on this survey, questions we could have included, or the market for sustainable investment in general we would be grateful to receive these here:		

# FTSE4Good Index Rules

Question 13: Any other feedback

The following questions are specifically for users of the FTSE4Good Index Series.

Throughout its history the FTSE4Good Series has helped to catalyse improvements in corporate practices with respect to global environmental, social and governance standards. This has been achieved through incremental enhancements to the methodology that have raised the bar for index inclusion over time.

FTSE Russell supports companies in the index through a programme of positive engagement, giving them a clear timeline to meet the enhanced requirements and to avoid index deletion. More details on this can be found in our Step Change report <a href="https://example.com/here1">here1</a>.

Since inception in 2001, the FTSE4Good Developed index has seen approximately half of the companies<sup>2</sup> in the underlying indexes qualifying for index inclusion. This has been achieved through gradual changes to the index inclusion methodology and through improving corporate practices<sup>3</sup>. The introduction of the new ESG methodology with phased company deadlines to meet the new thresholds was completed in 2017. With no additional significant threshold or criteria changes, the proportion of companies included has recently grown to approximately 60%<sup>3</sup> indicating that the criteria should be strengthened further.

A number of indexes' rules are aligned to that of the FTSE4Good Index Series, including the FTSE Blossom Japan Index, FTSE4Good TIP Taiwan ESG Index, and the FTSE JSE Responsible Investment Series. This alignment supports clarity of communication with companies and positive engagement.

In order to continue to raise the bar for inclusion in the FTSE4Good Index Series, FTSE Russell would like to receive feedback on the following proposals.

# **Question 12: Increasing the ESG Ratings inclusion thresholds**

There are a number of criteria to enter and maintain inclusion in the FTSE4Good and related indexes; central to these are the achievement of a minimum ESG Rating.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> http://www.ftserussell.com/sites/default/files/ftse\_russell\_step\_change\_2018\_report.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Measured by free-float market capitalisation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Note that although over the years hundreds of companies have been deleted for not keeping pace with the enhancements in criteria these have been replaced by others newly meeting the criteria for the first time.

Proposal: Consistent with the aim of the indexes to encourage further improvements in ESG practices over time FTSE Russell would like to gradually increase these Ratings thresholds in the coming years, whilst allowing sufficient time to clearly communicate and explain the change to clients and assessed companies.

The communication of this change to constituent companies facing potential deletion is expected to catalyze companies to improve to meet the higher threshold before implementation. This is a continuation of the FTSE4Good approach to raise the bar over time.

Please provide your response below.
A; I support the principle of raising the ESG Ratings thresholds over time;
☐ B: I do not support these proposals.
We would be grateful to receive further comments on this question:

### Question 13: Engaging with the weakest companies

The FTSE Russell ESG Ratings assess companies on up to fourteen Themes, covering a range of ESG topics. For each of the Themes a company receives an Exposure assessment, to determine the relevance of the ESG issue to its operations, and a Score that captures how well the company's controls, practices and performance are for that particular area.

As part of their inclusion criteria, the FTSE4Good Developed and FTSE Blossom Japan Indexes do not admit companies that for any of the 14 Themes receive a combination of the highest Exposure (materiality) assessment with the lowest Score (0 or 1). This rule prevents a company from entering the indexes that performs poorly in an ESG Theme that is highly relevant, even if their overall ESG Rating is above the threshold.

At present this rule only applies to potential entrants to the Developed market indexes and not current constituents (or to those from emerging markets).

FTSE Russell is proposing two changes to this rule:

- Apply this rule to <u>existing</u> FTSE4Good Developed constituents to harmonise with the entry rule. This
  would lead to FTSE Russell communicating to Developed constituents, with an assessment of a
  Exposure level of 3 and a Score of 0 or 1, that they could be deleted following a significant notice
  period.
- Apply this rule to entry in the FTSE4Good Emerging Markets indexes as well as the Developed indexes. This would prevent Emerging market constituents being added to the Indexes if they fail the same criteria.

Please provide your response below.
☐ A; I support these proposals
☐ B: I do not support these proposals
We would be grateful to receive further comments on this question:

### **Q12 History**

FTSE Russell continually reviews its sustainable investment methodologies to ensure they capture the evolution of market standards (e.g. TCFD, SASB, EU Taxonomy). Within this process we aim to find a balance between consistency in our methodologies whilst also incorporating important new datapoints and methodology enhancements. All of this occurs in consultation with our independent advisory committees. A key decision when collecting new data is the length of history required.

When you are considering using a sustainable investment index, what length of history should be provided? Please tick the box for each one that you feel is appropriate for each level of history:

☐ 1 Year: Not acceptable/ desirable/ essential

3 Years: Not acceptable/ desirable/ essential
5 Years: Not acceptable / desirable/essential
10 Years: Not acceptable/ desirable/essential
I do not use sustainable investment indexes
Comment

# For more information about our indexes, please visit ftserussell.com.

© 2019 London Stock Exchange Group plc and its applicable group undertakings (the "LSE Group"). The LSE Group includes (1) FTSE International Limited ("FTSE"), (2) Frank Russell Company ("Russell"), (3) FTSE Global Debt Capital Markets Inc. and FTSE Global Debt Capital Markets Limited (together, "FTSE GDCM"), (4) MTSNext Limited ("MTSNext"), (5) Mergent, Inc. ("Mergent"), (6) FTSE Fixed Income LLC ("FTSE FI") and (7) The Yield Book Inc ("YB"). All rights reserved.

FTSE Russell® is a trading name of FTSE, Russell, FTSE GDCM, MTS Next Limited, Mergent, FTSE FI and YB. "FTSE®", "Russell®", "FTSE Russell®", "MTS®", "FTSE4Good®", "ICB®", "Mergent®", "WorldBIG®", "USBIG®", "EuroBIG®", "AusBIG®", "AusBIG®", "The Yield Book®", and all other trademarks and service marks used herein (whether registered or unregistered) are trademarks and/or service marks owned or licensed by the applicable member of the LSE Group or their respective licensors and are owned, or used under licence, by FTSE, Russell, MTSNext, FTSE GDCM, Mergent, FTSE FI or YB. "TMX®" is a registered trademark of TSX Inc. FTSE International Limited is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority as a benchmark administrator.

All information is provided for information purposes only. All information and data contained in this publication is obtained by the LSE Group, from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human and mechanical error as well as other factors, however, such information and data is provided "as is" without warranty of any kind. No member of the LSE Group nor their respective directors, officers, employees, partners or licensors make any claim, prediction, warranty or representation whatsoever, expressly or impliedly, either as to the accuracy, timeliness, completeness, merchantability of any information or of results to be obtained from the use of the FTSE Russell Products or the fitness or suitability of the FTSE Russell Products for any particular purpose to which they might be put. Any representation of historical data accessible through FTSE Russell Products is provided for information purposes only and is not a reliable indicator of future performance.

No responsibility or liability can be accepted by any member of the LSE Group nor their respective directors, officers, employees, partners or licensors for (a) any loss or damage in whole or in part caused by, resulting from, or relating to any error (negligent or otherwise) or other circumstance involved in procuring, collecting, compiling, interpreting, analysing, editing, transcribing, transmitting, communicating or delivering any such information or data or from use of this document or links to this document or (b) any direct, indirect, special, consequential or incidental damages whatsoever, even if any member of the LSE Group is advised in advance of the possibility of such damages, resulting from the use of, or inability to use, such information.

No member of the LSE Group nor their respective directors, officers, employees, partners or licensors provide investment advice and nothing contained in this document or accessible through FTSE Russell Products, including statistical data and industry reports, should be taken as constituting financial or investment advice or a financial promotion.

This publication may contain forward-looking assessments. These are based upon a number of assumptions concerning future conditions that ultimately may prove to be inaccurate. Such forward-looking assessments are subject to risks and uncertainties and may be affected by various factors that may cause actual results to differ materially. No member of the LSE Group nor their licensors assume any duty to and do not undertake to update forward-looking assessments.

No part of this information may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the applicable member of the LSE Group. Use and distribution of the LSE Group data requires a licence from FTSE, Russell, FTSE GDCM, MTSNext, Mergent, FTSE FI, YB and/or their respective licensors.

### **About FTSE Russell**

FTSE Russell is a leading global index provider creating and managing a wide range of indexes, data and analytic solutions to meet client needs across asset classes, style and strategies. Covering 98% of the investable market, FTSE Russell indexes offer a true picture of global markets, combined with the specialist knowledge gained from developing local benchmarks around the world.

FTSE Russell index expertise and products are used extensively by institutional and retail investors globally. For over 30 years, leading asset owners, asset managers, ETF providers and investment banks have chosen FTSE Russell indexes to benchmark their investment performance and create investment funds, ETFs, structured products and index-based derivatives. FTSE Russell indexes also provide clients with tools for asset allocation, investment strategy analysis and risk management.

A core set of universal principles guides FTSE Russell index design and management: a transparent rules-based methodology is informed by independent committees of leading market participants. FTSE Russell is focused on index innovation and customer partnership applying the highest industry standards and embracing the IOSCO Principles. FTSE Russell is wholly owned by London Stock Exchange Group.

For more information, visit ftserussell.com.

To learn more, visit <a href="mailto:ftserussell.com">ftserussell.com</a>; or call your regional Client Service Team office:

**EMEA** +44 (0) 20 7866 1810

North America +1 877 503 6437 Asia-Pacific Hong Kong +852 2164 3333 Tokyo +81 3 4563 6346 Sydney +61 (0) 2 8823 3521